

**Presbytery Review Committee**  
**Minutes**  
April 2024

The General Assembly's Presbytery Review Committee met by web meeting on Friday, March 1, 2024. The 2024 Committee includes RE Ron Bengelink, RE Jane Bodden, RE Jim Conners, RE Keith Hopkins, RE Ray Kinat, RE George King, RE Bill Myers and TE Jason Steele in attendance and TE Mark Willems excused. As Chair, Ron Bengelink explained the task ahead and the importance of it to both the historical and legal requirements of our EPC denomination. He described the process, as well as the time constraints, for our task to review and document the corrections or additions to all of the 2023 meeting minutes of the sixteen presbyteries now operating in the EPC.

Two members of the Committee will read the minutes of four presbyteries, and each will document their findings of any Exceptions, Notations Requiring a Response, or Notations for each Presbytery. Although only Exceptions will be reported to the 44th meeting of the General Assembly, the findings in all three categories will be reported to the office of the Stated Clerk of the EPC. The Chair will then participate in a video conference with those two readers and, with support from the GA office staff, the three will agree on those findings to report for 2024. These video conferences will cover the review of two presbyteries each time and are scheduled on two days each week between March 12 and April 4. All Committee members were instructed to use the recently developed PRC Handbook as the primary resource for identifying possible violations of the Book of Order, the Rules for the Assembly, and the Acts of the Assembly during their review. This Handbook has also been made available to all Presbytery Stated Clerks to ensure that both the Presbytery Clerks and the PRC members are using the same set of expectations for the accuracy of those Minutes.

This year, the Chair reported having reviewed and documented the number of churches in each presbytery who had not sent any required representatives to any of the three Stated Meetings of that presbytery in 2023. The Chair also reviewed the responses from the various presbyteries to those Exceptions cited to them by the 43rd General Assembly regarding their 2022 presbytery minutes.

As a result of this review process, the Committee determined that:

1. After the review of presbytery responses to the Exceptions issued by the 43rd General Assembly in 2023, those responses are recommended by Common Consent to be approved for the cited presbyteries, including:

<b>Alleghenies</b>	<b>Mid America</b>
<b>Central Carolina</b>	<b>Midwest</b>
<b>Central South</b>	<b>Pacific NW</b>
<b>East</b>	<b>Pacific SW</b>
<b>Florida &amp; Caribbean</b>	<b>Southeast</b>
<b>Great Plains</b>	<b>West</b>
<b>Gulf South</b>	

2. The Committee reports that the situation when no representatives from a given church attended any of the Stated Meetings for the year 2023 was lower than that reported in 2021. However, in 2023 six presbyteries reported 10% or more of their churches were not represented at any stated meeting that year while one, Florida and the Caribbean, reported none in that category. For the entire denomination the average was 7% (approximately 50) of all churches in the EPC as compared to 6% in 2022 and 11% (just under 70 churches) in 2021.
3. The Committee reports the specific findings for the submitted Minutes of each Presbytery in their 2023 Stated Meetings as follows.

### **Alleghenies**

1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of the Presbytery of the Alleghenies be approved with the following *exceptions*:
  - a. Date of ordination/installation of TE Fixari not recorded. 47, p.956, 47-14C, **G.** 13-1A. **G.** 21-1C.2.b
  - b. No definite period of time set for TE Adrian Ciganic and TE Bob Cummings. 45, p.863, 45-11A. TE Suzanne Zampella, 46, p.919, 46-13A, and TE Tanner Fixari, 47, p.955, 47-14B. **G.** 10-8B.2a
2. The Committee will forward the following *notations requiring response* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the Alleghenies Presbytery.
  - a. Candidate Gaelen Negus' advisors are both from Lancaster EPC, as is he. 47, p.958, 47-20A. **G.** 11-2E
3. The Committee will forward the following *notations* to Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the Alleghenies Presbytery.
  - a. Incorrect Presbytery name should read "Presbytery of the Pacific Southwest". 45, p.863, 45-11A (4th bullet).
  - b. 46-14 lists Marc de Jue (incorrect). All other minutes used the correct spelling of de Jeu. 46, p.920, 46-14.
  - c. 47, Attachments not alphabetized (more difficult to find them)
4. General advice to the presbytery:
  - a. None
5. Commendations:
  - a. Well, done. Signatures at the very end after all exhibits and attachments is the correct process.

## Central Carolinas

1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of the Presbytery of the Central Carolinas be approved with the following *exceptions*:
  - a. No review of Session Minutes recorded. 2nd, 3rd & 4th meetings. **G.** 19-4A7. *Acts of Assembly* 07-08
  - b. Dismissal of Ridgecrest Presbyterian, Locust, NC. No details provided on previous steps or whether to independence or another denomination. 4th, 04-35.4A, p. 26. **G.** 5. 1 through 10., **G.** 19-4A.3
  - c. Change in call for TE Logan Keck to Lead Pastor. No record of a congregational vote. Also Lead Pastor is not a valid title, only Pastor. Same issue with title in paragraph k. 4th, 04-35.3J, p. 26, **G.** 9-5A.1, **G.** 10-6B, *Acts of Assembly* 02-04
  - d. TE Kevin Hartley's position on Westminster not recorded. 2nd, 02-24, p. 12&13, also TE Gabriel Swing's. 3rd, 03-24, p. 11, **G.** 12-4
  - e. TE Dr. Mark Hunter: Period of time not specified. 4th, 04-33, p. 24&24, **G.** 10-8B.2a
  - f. Session endorsement not recorded for candidates Katie Piquette and Chandler Owens; length of membership duration not recorded. 3rd, 03-22, p. 10, **G.** 11-2 and **G.** 19-4B2
  - g. No record of membership of Ministerial Committee. **G.** 21-2
2. The Committee will forward the following *notations requiring response* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the Central Carolinas Presbytery.
  - a. TE's listed only as excused or unexcused, no present. At best the attendance is unclear. 2nd, 3rd & 4th, *Acts of Assembly* 00-11
  - b. Each set of minutes begins with page 1. 2nd, 3rd & 4th, *Acts of Assembly* 98-05 and 05-08 #4 *Acts of Assembly* 16-25
  - c. TE Mike Lawrie, advisor, is the Pastor of Candidate Chandler Owens (Warehouse 242). 3rd, 03-22, p.11, **G.** 11-2E, *Acts of Assembly* 06-08 also Candidate Cesar Guerrero's advisor, TE Aron Gibson, is his pastor. 4th, 04-35, p.26, **G.** 11-2E, *Acts of Assembly* 06-08
  - d. Both meetings e-signed by only Moderator. Document created by Clerk but not e-signed. 2nd & 3rd, p.12, and Minutes not signed by Moderator. 4th, p.28, **G.**19-5D, Rules for Assembly 9-12 **G.**1
  - e. No financials reported in meetings 2 & 3. 2nd & 3rd, Rules for Assembly IX 9-12 **G.** 16
3. The Committee will forward the following *notations* to Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the Central Carolinas Presbytery.
  - a. Omnibus Motion outline numbering 3. Has sub-outline numbers from f-l making it unclear if a-e is missing or f-l is just mis-numbered. 4th, 04-35, p.25&26

4. General advice to the presbytery:

- a. None

5. Commendation:

- a. None

### Central South

1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of the Presbytery of the Central South be approved with the following **exceptions**:

- a. No mention that Michael Wey's Pastoral relationship with 1st Blytheville church was dissolved at a Congregation Meeting. 118, pg. 1015-1016, 118.08.3b, 118.08.4c., **G.** 14-1.B.
- b. No specific duties listed for TE Eli Morris, TE David Morris, TE Larry Lloyd, and TE Chad Johnson. 118, pg. 1018, 118.10, 120, pg. 1059, 120.20, 119, pg. 1032, 119.12, **G.** 10-5, **G.** 10-6.A.
- c. No defined time period for TE Hunter Bailey serving out of bounds. 118, pg. 1022, 118.22, 120, pg. 1052-1053, 120.07f. **G.** 10-8.b.2.A
- d. No mention that Bill Thompson's Pastoral relationship with Grace Presbyterian church was dissolved at a Congregation Meeting. 120, pg. 1050, 120.07.07.3.c. **G.** 14-1.B
- e. No mention that David Fischler's Pastoral relationship with First Presbyterian church was dissolved at a Congregation Meeting. 120, pg. 1050, 120.07.3.d., **G.** 14-1.B
- f. No mention that Matt Miller's Pastoral relationship with Woodland Presbyterian church was dissolved at a Congregation Meeting. 120, pg. 1050, 120.07.3.f, **G.** 14-1.B.
- g. No mention that Richard Rieves's Pastoral relationship with Downtown church was dissolved at a Congregation Meeting. 120, pg. 1050, 120.07.3g, **G.** 14-1.B.

2. The Committee will forward the following **notations requiring response** to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the Central South Presbytery.

- a. No listing of additional RE representatives allocated to churches to maintain a 1:2 ratio of TEs to RE's. 118, 119, 120, **G.** 19-2A.4b, *Acts of Assembly* 05-08.

3. The Committee will forward the following **notations** to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the Central South Presbytery.

- a. Date of 44th General Assembly is 2024, not 2023. 120, pg. 1051, 120.07.4.b.
- b. Lots of page numbers in 120th meeting unreadable. 120
- c. 2 extra pages after Page 1023 presumably as attachments. These should be appropriately labeled and included before the signatures of the Moderator and Clerk. 118, 119, and 120.

- d. Incorrect Presbytery for TE George Carey, should be POP Southwest. 120, pg. 1059, 120.20
  - e. Moderator Burton misspelled as Burotn. 120, pg. 1059, 120.20.
  - f. 118th Meeting ends with page 1023; 119th Meeting begins with page 1025; No page 1024. 118, pg. 1023, 119, pg. 1025. *Acts of Assembly* 16-25.
  - g. 119th Meeting ends with page 1043; 119th Meeting begins with page 1045; No page 1044. 119, pg. 1043, 120, pg.1045, *Acts of Assembly* 16-25
4. General advice to the presbytery:
- a. None
5. Commendation:
- a. Presbytery and churches stepped up to help churches in tornado relief.

### Coastal Mid-Atlantic

1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of the Coastal Mid-Atlantic Presbytery be approved with the following *exceptions*.
  - a. No record of closing in prayer. 4, no p.#, 1.12.11, **G.** 16-1A
  - b. Parity details provided, but no names. 2, no pg.#, 1.22, 3, no pg.#, 1.04, 4, no pg.#, 1.07, **G.** 19-2A.4b, *Acts of Assembly* 05-08
  - c. No details of Omnibus motion recorded. 2, no pg.#, 1.24, 4, no pg.#, 1.13.06.02
  - d. Reported that 13 of 36 churches submitted minutes; no names recorded. No mention of Session Records reviewed. 2, no pg.#, 1.12, 3, 4, **G.** 19-4A7, *Acts of Assembly* 07-08
  - e. Candidate Josh Woltmann’s position on Westminster standards not recorded. No statement that he had no exceptions. 2, no pg.#, 1.23. **G.** 12-4, *Acts of Assembly* 03-04
  - f. No details recorded on the transfer of TE Josh Woltmann from Gulf South. 2, no pg.#, 1.23, **G.** 14-1B
  - g. TE Josh Woltmann – no period of time recorded. 2, no pg.#, 1.23. 3, pg.7, 1.15. **G.** 10-8B.2a
  - h. “TE Taylor for the MC then recommended TE “Gutty” Guttridge as pastor at Hopewell EPC.” No explanation for why a call did not come from Hopewell. No date & time for installation. 4, pg.9, 1.13.06.03, **G.**10-3, **G.**10-4, **G.**13-1A. **G.**21-1C.2.b
  - i. Candidate Bryan Lees: No name of church where he is a member, no record of Session endorsement, no record of advisor. 3, no pg.#, 1.16. **G.** 11-2 H, I, & J. *Acts of Assembly* 02-04
  - j. Candidate Dan Yoon: No record of Session endorsement or of advisor. 4, no pg.#, 13.05. **G.** 11-2 H, I, & J. *Acts of Assembly* 02-04
  - k. Minutes of meetings 2 & 4 not signed. 2, 4. **G.** 19-5D
  - l. No record of membership of Ministerial Committee. 2. **G.** 21-2

2. The Committee will forward the following *notations requiring response* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the Coastal Mid-Atlantic Presbytery.
  - a. Only a very brief verbiage of a financial report, no tabular report. No budget. No audited/reviewed final report recorded in any of the minutes. 2, pg.6, 1.19, 3, pg.6, 1.10, 4, pg.9, 1.13. Rules for Assembly IX 9-12 **G.16**
  - b. Only names of excused TE's recorded and no names recorded on other meetings. 2, no pg.#, 1.25, 3, no pg.#, 1.04, 4, no pg.#, 1.07. *Acts of Assembly* 00-11
  - c. No summary of Descending Overture recorded. 4, no pg.#, 1.07.02. *Acts of Assembly* 07-08
  - d. Pages not numbered in any minutes. *Acts of Assembly* 98-05 and 05-08 #4, *Acts of Assembly* 16-25.
  - e. The Leadership Team invite any RE's who registered as Observers to upgrade their status to Commissioner - on the condition that you go back to your respective Sessions to be nominated as such and reported back to the Stated Clerk." 3, p.3, 1.07. 1 – This is not an acceptable practice. "Nominated" doesn't work. Must be elected. Elected means elected at either a Stated or Called Session meeting.
  - f. Annual review of Session records: Only stated that 13 of 36 transmitted, no list of reviewed churches. Review of Session records was not mentioned in mtg's 2 & 4 2, pg.3, 1.12, 2, 4. **G.19-4A7** *Acts of Assembly* 07-08
  - g. Votes not recorded on Descending Overture. 4, no pg.#, 1.07, **G. 19-4C.2**
  
3. The Committee will forward the following notations to Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the Coastal Mid-Atlantic Presbytery.
  - a. Duplication of TE Josh Woltmann's exam reported in 2/1.23. 3, no pg.#, 1.15
  - b. Stewardship Report Paragraph Format is not ideal for reading comprehension (Tabular is clearer). 2, no pg.#, 1.19, 3, no pg.#, 1.1, 4, no pg. #, 13.09
  - c. No attendee names, TE or RE. Mtg 1: Absent TE's were listed on the last page but did not include church affiliation. No names of TE's, RE's, or any others were recorded. No Visiting TE's, RE's enrolled as corresponding members with the privilege of the floor. No churches were listed. All meetings, 2, 3, and 4. *Acts of Assembly* 00-11, *Acts of Assembly* 03-04.4.
  - d. A roll of Associate Members and their attendance at meetings was not included. All meetings 2, 3, and 4. *Acts of Assembly* 16-25 (This being a new Presbytery, they may not have any Associate Members of Presbytery.)
  - e. There were no page numbers. All meetings 2, 3, and 4. *Acts of Assembly* 98-05 and 05-08 #4
  - f. Minutes pages were not consecutively numbered (no page numbers at all) All meetings 2, 3, and 4. *Acts of Assembly* 16-25
  - g. At the end of every report was a motion to "approve" the report. Seems 'approval' is not appropriate – voting to 'Receive' a report might be appropriate.

4. General advice to the presbytery:
  - a. None
5. Recommendation:
  - a. Have a main heading for all items under the Ministerial Committee and use subheadings for candidates coming under care, candidates seeking ordination and omnibus motions (which should be detailed)

## East

1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of the Presbytery of the East be approved with the following *exceptions*.
  - a. No primary responsibilities or definite period of time listed for TE Tyler Stanhope. 127, pg. 2, 127-14C, **G.** 10-6.A.
  - b. Advisor assigned to each Candidate coming under care - none listed. 129, pg. 2, 13C, **G.** 11-2E.
  - c. No mention that TE Rob Norris relationship with Fourth Evangelical Presbyterian church was dissolved at a Congregation Meeting. 127, pg. 3, 127-14D, **G.** 14-1.B.
  - d. Minutes shall report an annual review of session records of each church by name. None present in Minutes. 127, 128, and 129, **G.** 19-4A7.
  - e. Minutes must report the membership of the Presbytery's Ministerial Committee at its first meeting each year (or the last meeting of the previous year if elected for the next calendar year at that time). None found. Ministerial membership not listed to determine TE:RE ratio. Two new members only listed in 126. 127, 128, and 129 (126, pg. 001414, 126-33A), **G.** 21-2.
  - f. No primary responsibilities listed for TE Tim Chiarot, TE Ken Fanning or TE Marcos Ortega. 127, pg. 6-7, 127-22E, **G.** 10-6.A.
  - g. No definite period of time listed for Out of Bounds TE Michael Langer or TE Norman Yung. 129, pg. 5, 129-15B, **G.** 10-8.B.2.a.
  - h. No mention that TE Jeffrey Brower relationship with Middle Smithfield EPC was dissolved at a Congregation Meeting. 129, pg. 3, 129-13D, **G.** 14-1.B.
2. The Committee will forward the following notations requiring response to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the Presbytery of the East.
  - a. Minutes shall list the names of each Teaching Elder member of the Presbytery and note that person's attendance as present, excused or unexcused. 127, pg. 8, 128, pg. 9, 1, 129, pg. 8, 1, *Acts of Assembly* 00-11.
  - b. Minutes shall list the names of all Ruling Elders serving as Commissioners for each Church. Minutes shall also list all visiting Teaching Elders and Ruling Elders who have been enrolled as corresponding members with privilege of the floor. 127, pg. 8, 128, pg. 9, 1, 129, pg. 8, 1, *Acts of Assembly* 03-04.4.
  - c. Stated Meetings Minutes should include a Statement of Financial Position (Balance Sheet) and Statement of Financial Operations (Income Statement). 127, 128, 129, *Acts of Assembly* 07-09.

- d. RE to TE ratio correction should be a part of Minutes. 127, pg. 26, *Acts of Assembly* 05-08.
  - e. Correspondence should be a part of Minutes. 127, 128, pg. 21, 4, 129, pg. 20, 7, *Acts of Assembly* 08-13.
  - f. Approval of Budget - Budget not included in Minutes. 129, pg. 19, 7.
  - g. No information as to which denomination TE Michael Langer, TE Norman Yung or TE Jules Grisham came from. PC/USA? 129, pg. 4, 129-15A, **G.** 12-3.
3. The Committee will forward the following notations to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the Presbytery of the East.
- a. Since the Google drive is not an “in perpetuity” repository, items cited must be in the minutes.
4. General advice to the presbytery:
- a. None
5. Commendation:
- a. None

### **Florida and Caribbean**

1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of the Florida and Caribbean Presbytery be approved with the following *exceptions*.
- a. No opening prayer. 98, pg. 1, 98.01. **G.** 16-1.A.
  - b. No primary responsibilities or definite period of time for TE Charlie Halleran. 98, pg. 7-8, 98.07. **G.** 10-6.A.
  - c. The stated exceptions for TE Charlie Halleran are not to be reported in the minutes, only the fact that they were approved as stated. 98, pg. 7-8, 98.07. **G.** 12-4.
  - d. No primary responsibilities for TE Paul Gibson. 98, pg. 7-8, 98.07. **G.** 10-5.
  - e. No mention that TE Joe Tolin relationship with 1st Faith Presbyterian church was dissolved at a Congregation Meeting. 100, pg. 12, 100.11. **G.** 14-1.B.
  - f. Administrative Commission should be noted in the Omnibus Motion as part of #6 and doesn't appear to be part of the motion. 98, pg. 8, 98.7. **G.** 10-6.A.
  - g. Terms of Call are only items seemingly in the approval noted as “Without Objection. So Ordered”. 98, pg. 14, 98.15. **G.** 10-6.A.
  - h. Administrative Commission should be noted in the Omnibus Motion as part of #8 and doesn't appear to be part of the motion. 98, pg. 15, 98.15. **G.** 10-6.A.
  - i. If the MC has the authority of the Presbytery to act as a Commission, then Presbytery must vote to ratify their actions. MC Committee Actions seem to be reported but not ratified by Presbytery.



2. The Committee will forward the following notations requiring response to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the Florida and Caribbean Presbytery.
  - a. Session minutes review only had one report (Meeting 98) but did not provide any information about the number of churches or which churches had been reviewed. Should be at least one report annually. 98, 99, and 100. **G. 19-4.A.7, Acts of Assembly 07-08.**
  - b. Attendance is unclear that it is Attendance and who is Present. Suggest that only those Present be listed first and clearly stated as such. Then Excused and Unexcused listed separately. 98, pg. 1-3, 98.02, 99, pg. 1-3, 99.02, 100, pg. 1-3, 100.02.
  - c. No Quorum specifically declared even though it is implied in the header. 98, pg. 1, 98.01, 99, pg. 1, 99.01. **G. 19.5.C.**
  - d. Most motions are listed, but not documented that they passed. 98, 99, and 100. **G. 19-5.D.**
  
3. The Committee will forward the following *notations* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the Florida and the Caribbean Presbytery.
  - a. In general, motions should be more clearly stated that a committee made the motion (thus no second required) or was made from the floor (second required), what exactly is being voted on, and whether it passed. 98, 99, and 100. Roberts Rule of Order.
  - b. Remove “the” in the last line. 99, pg. 4, 99.03.
  - c. In Exam 1 – Rekeno Carroll, second paragraph begins with Keno, not Rekeno. 100, pg. 15, 100.11.
  
4. General advice to the presbytery
  - a. None
  
5. Commendation
  - a. None

## **Great Plains**

1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of the Great Plains Presbytery be approved with the following *exceptions*:
  - a. It was moved, seconded, and approved that Mainor Arcia Madrigal, a pastor in good standing within Iglesia Comunidad el Camino (Costa Rica), serve as Stated Supply Assistant Pastor. A Stated Supply Pastor must be invited by Session. 29, p.626, 29:06-2, G10-7A.2a
  - b. There was no mention of additional RE’s required of some churches to meet 2:1 RE:TE (Parity). All meetings, 28, 29, and 30. **G. 19-2A.4b, Acts of Assembly 05-08**
  - c. Membership of the Ministerial Committee not recorded to demonstrate the TE/RE ratio. **G. 21-2**

2. The Committee will forward the following *notations requiring response* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the Great Plains Presbytery.
  - a. All meetings show Present or Absent, followed by a letter denoting the absence reason. It somewhat complicates attendance records and does not follow the *Acts of Assembly* guidance. Meeting # 30 showed no breakout by category. 28, p.607-611, 28:02E, 29, p.621-625, 29:02F, 30, p. 634-638, 30:02F. *Acts of Assembly* 00-11
  - b. Financial report was given for 2022, but there was no 2023 Budget and no audit and financial report was given for 2023, through 3/31, but there was no 2023 budget and no audit and financial report was given for 2023, through 8/31, 2024 Budget was shown (not approved), but no Audit. 28, p.615, 28:12, 29, p.629, 29:15, 30, p.10, 30:11, Rules for Assembly IX 9-12 **G.16**
  - c. It was moved, seconded, and approved that RE Gary Fuller be invited to serve as temporary Stated Supply Transitional Pastor of Avery Presbyterian Church (Bellevue NE) for a renewable term of one year.” Lack of clarity – Is Gary Fuller an RE or TE? If an RE, shouldn’t the position be a Commissioned Pastor? Also, the title of “Temporary Stated Supply Transitional Pastor” combines two temporary pastoral relationships: **G. 10-7A.1 & 2**, 29, p.626, 29:06.1, **G. 19-4B.3**
  - d. Jordin Greer: Church of which she was a member, nor from which congregational members advocated for her, was not named. Also, as an employee of WO, is she serving out of bounds? No definite period of time set. 28, p.614, 28:09, **G. 10-8B.2a**
  - e. It was recorded that some churches have been reviewed, but there was no list of reviewed churches. 29, p.629, 29:13, **G.19-4A7**, *Acts of Assembly* 07-08
  - f. Candidate for Ordination, Julien de Leiris & Jacob Schmitz were “interviewed” but no details of the exam were recorded. 30, p.12, 30:14, **G.11-2** and **G.19-4B2**, Clerk’s Handbook “Minutes must include an accurate record of candidates received and dismissed including all of the required steps to do so.”
  - g. “It was moved, seconded, and sustained to approve TE Drew Henderson laboring outside the bounds of Great Plains in the Presbytery of Mid America.” No details were recorded (where, doing what, how long). 30, p.14, 30:16, **G.19-4B.3**, **G.10-8B.2**, *Acts of Assembly* 05-08, **G.10-8B.2a**
  
3. The Committee will forward the following notations to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the Great Plains Presbytery.
  - a. TE Richard Rieves from Central South Presbytery was seated as a Corresponding member but not given privilege of floor as well as 4 people seated as Corresponding members, but not given privilege of floor. 29, p.620, 29:02D, 30, p.633, 30:02D. *Acts of Assembly* 03-04.4
  
4. General advice to the presbytery
  - a. None
  
5. Commendation to the presbytery
  - a. None

## Gulf South

1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of the Gulf South Presbytery be approved with the following *exceptions*:
  - a. No mention of a Congregational Meeting to dissolve the Pastoral relationship between TE Joshua Hutson and Graceminster Monroe. 27, pg. 155, 27.21. **G.** 14-1.B.
  - b. No mention of a Congregational Meeting to dissolve The First Presbyterian Church of Houma. 28, pg. 168, 28.13.2. **G.** 5-9.
  - c. Dissolving First Presbyterian Houma - really is described as a merger. No BoO reference. 28, pg. 165, 13. **G.** 5-9.
2. The Committee will forward the following *notations requiring response* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the Gulf South Presbytery.
  - a. The approval of the 2023 Annual Budget was not documented. 26. *Rules of Assembly* IX 9-12 **G.**16.
  - b. Minutes must include reception of annual audited or reviewed states of financial position (balance sheet) and operations (income statement). Attachments as the treasures report need to be a part of the minutes therefore the signature page needs to follow all attachments. 26, 27, and 28. *Acts of Assembly* 07-09.
3. The Committee will forward the following notations to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the Gulf South Presbytery.
  - a. None
4. General advice to the presbytery
  - a. None
5. Commendations
  - a. None

## Mid-America

1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of the Mid-America Presbytery be approved with the following *exceptions*:
  - a. None
2. The Committee will forward the following *notations requiring response* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the Mid-America Presbytery.
  - a. None

3. The Committee will forward the following *notations* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the Mid-America Presbytery.
  - a. Notation was made about attachments # 3 and # 1, but they were not found attached to the minutes of the Presbytery. 97, pg. 1460, 97.02-5, 97, pg. 1466, 97.03. Attachment #10 – PRC and Stated Clerics Handbook, *Acts of Assembly 07-09*\*\* \*\* These Guidelines were reaffirmed and referenced in the *Acts of Assembly 07-09* but are only fully stated as reproduced here in *Acts of Assembly 26-40* (p.273-274).
4. General advice to the presbytery
  - a. None
5. Commendation
  - a. Outstandingly clear and concise minutes. Appreciation for all the details and conclusion of discussions on top of appropriate notation of actions taken place. Well, done. Keep up the good work.
  - b. All 2023 exceptions were corrected and reflected in the October 27-28 minutes.

## Midwest

1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of the Midwest Presbytery be approved with the following *exceptions*:
  - a. Matthew Leithen, BJ Newman, No time period for these Out of Bounds calls. 180, pg. 9-10, 180-08. **G.** 10-8B.2a.
2. The Committee will forward the following notations requiring response to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the Midwest Presbytery.
  - a. Reviewing the list of attendees there appears to be several visiting TE's in attendance, in the list of Administrators, Out of Bounds, Without Call, Retired & Others, but they were not enrolled as corresponding members with the privilege of the floor. 178, 179, and 180. *Acts of Assembly 03-04.4*.
  - b. Session Records Committee report - no list of churches whose Session Minutes have been reviewed. 178, 179, and 180. *Acts of Assembly 07-08*.
  - c. Minutes did not report the membership of the Presbytery's Ministerial Committee at its first meeting (or later meetings) each year to define for that year that its ratio of Teaching Elders to Ruling Elders meets the requirements for that Committee. 178. **G.** 21-2, *Acts of Assembly 05-08*
3. The Committee will forward the following *notations* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the Midwest Presbytery.
  - a. "Oakland Revitalization Commission be dissolved - the more proper word choice is dismissed. 178, pg. 12, 12

- b. This section was titled “Ministerial Committee: Overture Regarding Paedobaptism” (infant baptism).
  - c. What followed, turned out to be a motion (which passed) that a Pastoral Letter be accepted as guidance from the Midwest Presbytery – not an Overture. 178, pg. 10, 178-08. The word “Overture” should not be used here.
  - d. Reports, like Finance, were ‘approved’ by Presbytery – but Presbytery does not have the detailed knowledge to “approve” these reports. They should vote to “receive” them.
- 4. General advice to the Presbytery
    - a. None
  - 5. Commendation
    - a. Minutes are improving and contain more of the suggested/required guidelines.

### **New River**

- 1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of the New River Presbytery be approved with the following *exceptions*:
  - a. None
- 2. The Committee will forward the following *notations requiring response* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the New River Presbytery.
  - a. Minutes pages were not numbered. 002, 003, 004. Act of Assembly 16-225
  - b. The call to TE Shipton as an Evangelist – Question of if this is simply a call being extended, or was this considered an ordination vote or a change of ordination? If ordination, it does not seem to follow the prescribed steps for ordination. 002, pg. 10, B3-3. **G. 5-4A.1, G.9-5C2, G.10-8A2, G. 12.**
- 3. The Committee will forward the following notations to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the New River Presbytery.
  - a. None
- 4. General advice to presbytery
  - a. None
- 5. Commendation
  - a. Exceptionally well-organized and clear minutes. Overall easy to read, concise and not lacking in important details.

## Pacific Northwest

1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of the Pacific Northwest Presbytery be approved with the following *exceptions*.
  - a. Mtg 16 - A count of churches (9) whose minutes had been reviewed was recorded but the reviewed churches were not named. Mtg 17 & 18 – Reviewed churches were not named. 16, pg. 312, 16-20, 17, pg. 321, 17-10, 18, pg. 345, 18-8. **G. 19-4A7, Acts of Assembly 07-08.**
2. The Committee will forward the following *notations requiring response* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the Pacific Northwest.
  - a. Parity – Number of Elders allowed per **G.19-2A4a**: The calculation for Chapel Hill is incorrect. The church has 1336 members. The table on page 299 shows 12 ‘allowed’ per the number of members. This should be 6 (2 for each 500 members). That would make the ‘Total Elders’ 11 (including the 1 additional Elder) instead of the 13 shown in the table. 16, pg. 299, 16-4. **G. 19-2A.**
  - b. “Motion was sustained to enroll visiting Teaching and Ruling Elders from other presbyteries or General Assembly as corresponding members with the privilege of the floor.” No names were listed with this motion, just the reference to the attendance list. 16, pg. 301, 16-6. *Acts of Assembly 03-04.4.*
3. The Committee will forward the following notations to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the Pacific Northwest Presbytery.
  - a. “Approval” of detailed written reports, such as Finance, is not appropriate where the Presbytery membership does not have the detailed information for an informed decision. 16, pg. 308, 16-10. “Adoption” or “Reception” of these reports would be appropriate.
  - b. Candidates Under Care Preston Conger’s and Michael Meadows’ Advisors’ church affiliation was not listed. This required going back & researching the attendance list to see what church is listed for the Advisor. 16, pg. 311, 16-19. **G. 11-2E, Acts of Assembly 06-08**
4. General advice to the presbytery
  - a. It would be very helpful, & time saving for the reviewer, if the Advisor’s church was noted when naming the Advisor.
5. Commendation
  - a. Very well written/organized and easy to read.

## **Pacific Southwest**

1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of the Pacific Southwest Presbytery be approved with the following *exceptions*.
  - a. None
2. The Committee will forward the following *notations requiring response* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the Pacific Southwest Presbytery.
  - a. TE Pastor/ Associate/Assistant Pastor Terms of Call (or change in the terms of call) were not made public or recorded as approved by the presbytery. 16, pg. 219, 16-10, 16, pg. 222-223, 16-27, 17, pg. 241, 17-9, 17, pg. 244, 17-26, 17, pg. 245, 17-31, 18, pg. 269, 18-34, 18, pg. 270, 18-35. *Acts of Assembly* 98-04, pg. 185, *Acts of Assembly* 11-08, pg. 200.
3. The Committee will forward the following *notations* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the Pacific Southwest Presbytery.
  - a. “the eighteenth meeting” should read “the first called meeting”. 1st Called Meeting, August 12, 2023, Paragraph C1-1.
4. General advice to the Presbytery
  - a. None
5. Commendation
  - a. The minutes were succinct, organized, easy to follow, and clear to read. Appreciation for a job well done.
  - b. Thank you for providing such excellent records.

## **Rivers and Lakes**

1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of the Rivers and Lakes Presbytery be approved with the following *exceptions*:
  - a. None
2. The Committee will forward the following *notations requiring response* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the Rivers and Lakes Presbytery.

- a. Ministerial Commission was given authority to install TE Barksdale “at a future agreed upon date.” No report was found regarding the installation in consequent minutes. 37, pg. 609, 37.19. **G. 10-8.B1c, G. 13-1A.1, Acts of Assembly 16-23.2.**
  - b. Ministerial Commission was given authority to install TE Groen “at a future agreed upon date.” No report was found regarding the installation in consequent minutes. 38, pg. 617, 38.16. **G. 10-8.B1c, G. 13-1A.1, Acts of Assembly 16-23.2.**
3. The Committee will forward the following notations to Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the Rivers and Lakes Presbytery.
    - a. New Moderator Tromble was “welcomed.” No mention was made of an installation to office. 37, pg. 600, 37.06.
    - b. Typo in 3rd sentence. “Them” should be “then.” 38, pg. 611, 38.04.
    - c. Typo in 7th paragraph. “Barksdale” should be “Groen.” 38, pg. 616, 38.16
    - d. Typo in 2nd paragraph, 2nd sentence. “Role” should be “roll.” 39, pg. 630, 36.16.
  4. General advice to the presbytery
    - a. None
  5. Commendations
    - a. The minutes were well presented and easy to follow. Thank you for following up on the exceptions/notations from last year.

## **Southeast**

1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of the Southeast Presbytery be approved with the following *exceptions*:
  - a. None
2. The Committee will forward the following *notations requiring response* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the Southeast Presbytery.
  - a. TE Kelly’s exceptions to Westminster were noted but not allowed. 120, pg. 264, 120.08. **G. 12-4.**
  - b. The minutes should be labeled as the 120th meeting, not the 20th meeting. 120, pg. 258, Oct 23.
3. The Committee will forward the following *notations* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the Southeast Presbytery.
  - a. None



4. General advice to the presbytery

a. None

5. Commendation

a. None

**West**

1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of the West Presbytery be approved with the following *exceptions*:

a. The members of the Administrative Commission for Mountain Road were not listed. 128, pg. 8, 128.13. **G. 21-C.2.b.**

b. The advisors for candidates Morgan and Gaessler were not named. 128, pg. 9, 128.14, **G. 11-2E.**

2. The Committee will forward the following *notations requiring response* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the West Presbytery.

a. None

3. The Committee will forward the following *notations* to Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the West Presbytery.

a. The reference to Mr. Chad Johnson as “Rev. Johnson’s” is premature prior to his ordination and installation. 128, pg. 7, 128.8.

4. General advice to the presbytery

a. None

5. Commendation

a. The effort to bring the minutes of the Presbytery into conformity with the Book of Order and *Acts of Assembly* is very much appreciated. Keep up the good work!

b. Very good and clear minutes, with so much taking place within the ministerial committee, it makes these minutes very brief.

**Committee members for this Presbytery Review Committee for 2024 include:**

RE Ron Bengelink	Presbytery of the Pacific Northwest
RE Jane Bodden	Presbytery of Florida & the Caribbean
RE Jim Conners	Presbytery of the Pacific Southwest
RE Keith Hopkins	Presbytery of the Pacific Northwest
RE Ray Kinat	Presbytery of the Alleghenies
TE George King	Presbytery of the Gulf South
RE Bill Myers	Presbytery of the Pacific Southwest
TE Jason Steele	Presbytery of the Midwest
TE Mark Willems	Presbytery of the Pacific Northwest

The Committee reviewed and approved these minutes on Apr. 18, 2024



Ron Bengelink, Committee Chair



Vanessa Mullendore, Recording Clerk