## Presbytery Review Committee Minutes April 2021

The Presbytery Review Committee met by web meeting on Thursday, March 18, 2021 with Chair RE Ron Bengelink, RE Jane Bodden, RE Ray Kinat, RE George King, RE Gary O'Keefe, and TE Jason Steele, present. The meeting convened with prayer. Assistant Stated Clerk Jerry Iamurri oriented the Committee to its task and explained the process for minutes review in 2021. Committee members will read their assigned minutes (two for each set of presbytery minutes) and put in writing their proposed exceptions, notations requiring a response, and notations and place the electronic files in a shared folder. The Committee agreed to a schedule of video conference meetings for each set of minutes. During those conferences, the readers will reach consensus on the exceptions to be reported to the Assembly. The entire committee will convene April 30, 2021 via video conference to approve the full report. Notations requiring response and general notations will be sent to Presbytery Stated Clerks by September 30, 2021.

The minutes were approved by the entire committee on a web meeting on April 30, 2021.

Presbytery responses to exceptions from the 40<sup>th</sup> General Assembly, exceptions to the 2020 Presbytery Minutes, and other recommendations will go to the 41<sup>st</sup> General Assembly in the report of the Presbytery Review Committee.

- I. Review of Presbytery responses to pending issues and exceptions issued by the 40<sup>th</sup> General Assembly (2020) **BY COMMON CONSENT** the Committee recommends that the Assembly approve the responses of the following Presbyteries:
  - A. Central South
  - B. Florida and the Caribbean
  - C. Mid-Atlantic
  - D. Midwest \*
  - E. Pacific Northwest
  - F. Southeast \*
  - G. West
  - \* It was later noted that these Presbyteries each neglected to respond to the *Exception* cited by the 40<sup>th</sup> General Assembly. They were contacted by the Chair and their responses submitted in late May 2021 were judged sufficient.

## II. Minutes Subject to Review by the 40<sup>th</sup> General Assembly

#### A. Alleghenies

- 1. The committee recommends that the Minutes of the Alleghenies Presbytery be approved with the following *exceptions*.
  - a. For Mr. Justin Olivetti and 36-18A (p.664) for TE Matthew Geary must list the membership of the Commissions appointed to ordain and/or install TE's to show

each member's office and church represented. Minutes must also list the location and date of that proposed activity., G.21-1A.2

- b. 35th and 36th Meeting. The reports of the Administrative Commissions for these three activities listed above are not included in the Minutes of the 35th meeting or the 36th meeting as required by G.21-1A.2
- c. An out of bounds call be approved "for a term of up to three years." No term identified for TE Cummings, TE Bowers or TE Zampella. 34-11B, p. 635, 35-11B, p. 649. G10-8B2(a), pp. 25-26.
- d. Call of an Assistant Pastor "shall be for a definite period of time." No time period identified for Rev Geary. 36-18A, p. 664 G.10-6A, p. 23
- 2. The committee will forward the following *notations requiring responses* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the Alleghenies Presbytery.
  - a. When any Teaching Elder receives a new Call to a congregation within the Presbytery its Minutes must report that person's Terms of Call as approved in public using the forms found in the Book of Order and the Procedure Manual for Ministerial and Candidates Committees. No terms of call provided in minutes for TE Clark, TE Sparr or Rev Geary. 34-11C, p. 636, 35-11B, p. 649, 36-18A, p. 664. *Acts of Assembly* 12-11(1), p. 194
  - b. Presbyteries "include a section on "Correspondence" in their minutes with dates on which official correspondence is received and sent." Not included for any of the reviewed minutes. 34th, 35th, and 36th Meetings, *Acts of Assembly* 8-13.4, p. 192
  - c. (1) Did anyone advocate for TE Clark? (2) RE from Graystone should be identified by name and it should be clear he/she spoke as their representative.
    "Congregation to "appoint representative to advocate the call (of Pastor) at a meeting of the Presbytery. 34-11C, p. 636, 35-11B, p. 649, G.10-4G, pp. 22-23
  - d. When recording votes on descending overtures, minutes should include a brief summary of the descending overture. Discussion of Descending Overture 19-A and 19-B do not mention the subject matter. 34-18B, pp. 639-640, *Acts of Assembly* 07-8.3, p. 191
  - e. Transitional pastors "will ordinarily be appointed by the presbytery to moderate the Session" and be "enrolled as corresponding member." Not clear if either of these was done for TE Stauffer. 35-11B, p.649 **G.**10-7A1(a,c), p. 23
  - f. The approved budget should be included in the minutes, not just the notation that it was approved. 36-16A, p. 663 *Rules for Assembly* IX 9-12G.16, p. 167
  - g. The Financial Report for the year 2019 and the independent review of that Report are not included in the Minutes of the 34th meeting of the Presbytery. (The Financial Report is included as an attachment, but the page numbering indicates that it is not a part of the Presbytery's Book of Minutes.) 34th Meeting *Rules for Assembly* IX 9-12G.16
  - h. The "Ratio Correction" for the TE to RE ratio for the year 2020 must be included in the Minutes not just mentioned. 34th Meeting. 34-18C (p. 18C) *Acts of Assembly* 05-08

- Contrary to the Stated Clerk's response to the PRC's Notations Requiring a Response for the Presbytery's 2019 Minutes, the details of the Installations for TE Phillips and TE Brubaker are not recorded in the 34th Stated Meeting Minutes. Referring to the existence of such a report in the Clerk's files does not meet this requirement.
- 3. The committee will forward the following *notations* to Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the Alleghenies.
  - a. States that Moderator "asked for a motion" but never states that one was made. Implied, since motion approved, but should be stated. 34-07, p. 633 35-07, p. 647 36-08, p. 659
  - Rev. Hemphill declared no exceptions to the Westminster Confession of Faith, but minutes still indicate that his exceptions were allowed. 35-11C, p. 650; Acts of Assembly 03-09, p.203
  - c. Should be made clear in the minutes that the golf outing is a fund raiser for EduNations. 35-12, p. 650
  - d. The candidate's advisor should not ordinarily be the candidate's pastor. In minutes of 36th meeting (but not the 35th), advisor's church is identified which makes it easier to check this item. Recommend continuing this practice. 35-14A-D, pp. 650-651 36-15E, F, pp. 662-663 G.11-2E, p. 28 *Acts of Assembly* 06-8.1, p. 191
- 4. General advice to the presbytery.

The annual review of all Presbytery Minutes by the General Assembly's PRC is required primarily to provide both a historical and legal record of compliance with the requirements of the Constitution of the EPC and its various General Assemblies. The Stated Clerk should strive to record the Presbytery's actions in such a way as to reflect that need for a stand-alone historical and legal record.

- 5. Commendations:
  - a. Commend the golf outing to support EduNations. This not only provides an opportunity to financially support a mission partner but does so in a way that also provides an opportunity for members of the presbytery to engage with each other in a social setting. A Golf tournament was held for the second year to support their mission partner Edu Nations in Sierra Leone. In 2020 the tournament raised \$33,000 for that cause. 34th, p. 639 35th, 35-12, p. 650 36th, p. 663

## **B.** Central South

1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of Central South Presbytery be approved with the following *exceptions*.

- 2. The Committee will forward the following *notations requiring response* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of Central South Presbytery.
  - a. Although the summary Financial Report for the previous year (2019) is included in the body of the Minutes the report of an independent review of that report and the Treasurer's books for that year is not reported here. 109th Meeting. 109.09 item 2 (p. 868) *Rules for Assembly* IX 9-12G.16

- b. The required short description of the Descending Overtures was not included in the Minute reporting the vote on those overtures. 109th Meeting. 109.10 (p.870) Acts of Assembly 07-08
- c. The "Ratio Correction" requirement for RE's from the various churches was not reported or included in the Minutes of any of the three meetings for 2020. 109th Meeting *Acts of Assembly* 05-08
- d. Presbytery Stated Clerks should not be part of commissions, but rather be a resource to those commissions. Other than commissions related to celebratory activities (e.g., ordination and installation), 109 attachment, First Ripley Administrative Commission, *Acts of Assembly* 07-08.
- e. No Book of Order reference for dissolving the call should have listed G.14-1. No statement in Minutes indicating both congregation and Pastor concur in dissolution. 111.16, p.907
- The Committee will forward the following *notations* to Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of Central South Presbytery. None
- 4. General Advice to the presbytery. None
- 5. Commendations:
  - a. The fact that their Minutes included extensive and helpful written reports from three of the Presbytery's current church plants. Very well written procedure for what Presbytery is looking for when reviewing Session Minutes. 109.12. p. 870-872

# C. East

1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of Presbytery of the East be approved with the following *exceptions*.

- 2. The Committee will forward the following *notations requiring responses* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of Presbytery of the East.
  - a. Terms of Call for Timothy Latham shows: "Social Security Offset Allowance (7.65% of Effective Salary)" but no dollar value is shown. Does the blank value mean zero? Values are shown for every other compensation line item. Further down in these same minutes, on page 1205, "Social Security Allowance" shows a dollar figure – which would seem to indicate that a blank means zero.119th minutes, section 119-12B, page 1198
  - b. 119th minutes, section 119-23B, page 1207: Exam of Timothy Chiaot. The minutes explain that Mr. Chiaot was a PCA Pastor and was originally examined in 2009 as an Assistant Pastor in an EPC church when it was a mission church. He is now being examined again to serve as an Interim at a branch of another EPC church. Why is he being examined again? Did he leave EPC and is now coming back (again)? The minutes go on to say he is being examined per G.12-3A&B, which is examination of a Candidate for Ordination as if he had never been ordained. That seems inconsistent.

- c. 119th minutes, pages 1211, section 119-23J "Place on Retired Roll": Only a motion was passed to place TE William Teague on the Retired Roll. No mention of G.15-1B (Recognition of Retirement) actions were noted, including noting whether he was still Active or Inactive. 117th, 119th, 120th minutes. None of the minutes recorded on 'Pastoral care of retired Teaching Elders' in G.15-1C "The Presbytery shall be responsible for making an annual review of its retired members to be sure of their welfare and to rectify any deficiencies. Such annual review shall be reported to the court and recorded in its minutes."
- d. In section 117-35, page 1171, Report of the Stewardship Team, a RE agreed to "perform the annual Independent Review of the Financial Records". Although an agreement to perform the review was recorded, no review was recorded in the first meeting of the year. *Rules for Assembly* 9-12G.16
- e. The 117th minutes (January), page 1159, section 117-12, recorded receiving 3 people (TE Phil Linton, RE Roy Yanke, RE Tom Jameson, as corresponding members but did not record giving them privilege of the floor. In section 117-18B it appears that these gentlemen gave a training presentation, therefore, should have been granted privilege of floor. 117th, p.1159, section 117-12; *Acts of Assembly* 03-04
- f. The 117th minutes (January), 119th minutes (September), & 120th minutes (November) recorded "(P)" for Pastors present and "(A)" for Pastors absent. There was no 'excused' and 'unexcused' notation for absent Pastors in the list of attendees. 117th, 119th, and 120th Meetings; *Acts of Assembly* 00-11
- g. 119th minutes, section 119-21B, page 1204: Three new churches were received as "local churches" but very little details were given as listed in G.5. The three churches were apparently developed as "church plants/mission groups", all from one 'parent' church. It appears that G.5-5 "Establishing a mission church as a local church" applies in this case.
- The Committee will forward the following *notations* to Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the Presbytery of the East. None
- 4. General advice to the presbytery.

None

5. Commendations:

None

# D. Florida and the Caribbean

- 1. The Committee will forward the following *notations requiring responses* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the Florida and the Caribbean Presbytery.
  - a. There are no page numbers in the 89<sup>th</sup> Stated Meeting minutes. Page numbers are the same in 2019 and 2020. 86<sup>th</sup> meeting, 90<sup>th</sup> meeting, 89<sup>th</sup> meeting, *Acts of Assembly* 05-08.4, p. 190, *Acts of Assembly* 16-25.2, p. 196
  - b. Stated Clerks Report Presbytery minutes should reflect the requirements of **G**. 21-1A.2, namely, that minutes of commissions are not approved by presbytery.

Commissions report their actions, and that report of those actions is recorded in the presbytery minutes. Minutes of Commissions should be kept separately. <u>See</u> <u>Presbytery response to PRC notation from last year</u>. 89.08, *Acts of Assembly* 09-05.

- c. **G.**10-4G requires congregation to "appoint representative to advocate the call (of Pastor) at a meeting of the Presbytery. While omnibus motion regarding Rev Tolin included allowing such a speaker, and TE Franklin was recorded as praying for him, there is no record of anyone advocating the call. 89-11, no page number; **G.**10-4G, p.22-23
- d. Minutes shall provide an accurate record of motions passed and actions taken **G**. 19-5D. It is assumed that the motion to assist Candidates Under Care with travel costs specifically limited this benefit to Candidates Under Care. Should be so reflected in the motion as presented in the minutes. 89.11, no page number; *Rules for Assembly* IX 9-12.G.4, p. 166
- The Committee will forward the following *notations* to Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the Florida and the Caribbean Presbytery. None
- 4. General advice to the presbytery. None
- 5. Commendations:
  - a. Very good use of the correspondence received section. 89.08, no page number; 91.05, p.787-788
  - b. Very detailed Minutes. Especially noteworthy was the detail in the Treasurer's Report. 89.14
  - c. Bilingual Prayer "Moderator Bill Reisenweaver welcomed the incoming Moderator Enid Flores and led the court in prayer in Spanish by TE Juan Rivera and in English by TE Bill Reisenweaver." 91.11, p.803

# E. Great Plains

- 1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of the Great Plains Presbytery be approved with the following *exceptions*.
  - a. Candidate Jordin Greer and Advisor Stan Van Den Berg, the Pastor, are from the same church, Eastminster Presbyterian Church. No justification for not following the requirement for "ordinarily not the Candidate's Pastor". 19-06B, Page 504, G.11-2E, Acts of Assembly 06-08.
  - b. Candidate Scott Matson and Advisor Aaron Elmore, the Pastor, are from the same church, Kirk of the Hills. No justification is presented for not following the requirement for "not ordinarily the Candidate's Pastor". 19-06A, page 504, G.11-2E, *Acts of Assembly* 06-08.
- 2. The Committee will forward the following *notations requiring responses* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the Great Plains Presbytery.
  - a. Sessional Review: All churches whose minutes were reviewed need to be identified. *Acts of Assembly*-07-08, *Rules for Assembly* 9-12G.10, p. 166

- b. Descending Overture No summary of the overture is included. 19.04, page 504, *Acts of Assembly* 07-08-3
- c. Names of 4 people listed as Corresponding Members; 1 listed as such, the other three names listed as Visitors. 19-02, p.495, 500-501, *Acts of Assembly* 00-11& *Acts of Assembly* 03-04.4
- d. 19th and 20th meetings listed present and absent only, no excused or unexcused. 19-02, p.496-501, 20-21-G, p. 509-514. *Acts of Assembly* 00-11
- e. 20th & 21st minutes, page 517, section 20-21:08 Sessional Records. Records that "records reviewed were in great shape" but does not list the names of the churches reviewed. *Acts of Assembly* 07-08.1 requires the names of the churches reviewed.
- f. No time was recorded for the start or end of the 19th, 20th, and 21st meetings. *Rules for Assembly* 9-12G.1 requires a time of day.19th, p.495, 19-02-B, 20th, p. 508, 20-21:02B, 21st, p. 517-518, 20-21:10, *Rules for Assembly* 9-12G.1
- g. 19th minutes Budget & Financial Review of prior year. There was no 2020 budget approved. *Rules for Assembly* 9-12G.16
- 3. The Committee will forward the following *notations* to Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the Great Plains Presbytery.
  - a. 19<sup>th</sup> minutes, page 500 Attendance list lists a Corresponding Member but this person is not recorded as 'with privilege of the floor'. *Acts of Assembly* 03-04.4
  - b. 20th & 21st minutes, page 514, 515, section 20-21:04 Treasurer's report this shows balances in certain accounts, but does not appear to show spending, and a financial details attachment is not referenced or listed a received in the 'Consent Agenda' (omnibus motion). *Acts of Assembly*: 07-09. The Assembly approves financial reporting guidelines for presbytery minutes. (Minutes, 26- 40, and Minutes of the 26th General Assembly (2006), pp. 273-274).
  - c. 20th & 21st minutes, page 517, section 20-21:09 Moderator's Report includes an installation of TE Kirk Johnson as Moderator of the Great Plains Presbytery. This was performed at the end of the meeting, so this is assumed to be for the next year's meetings, but that fact (for next year's meetings) was not recorded.
- 4. General advice to the presbytery.

None

- 5. Commendations:
  - a. Using Consent Agenda very helpful to the reviewer.

## F. Gulf South

1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of the Gulf South Presbytery be approved with the following *exceptions*.

- a. The examination of all Teaching Elders for ordination and/or installation shall include an approval of their position with respect to the Westminster Standards either with no stated exceptions or an acceptance of any stated exception(s). This is not recorded for Candidates Stinson, Edwards, Foster, Hutson or Watson or for the transfer of Rev. Edwards. 17.17, 10, 13, p. 9 19.05, 13-15, p. 35 G.12-4.p. 30.
- b. The purpose of the called meeting should be clearly stated, as well as the

details of the call. This demonstrates for the record that (1) the requirements for calling the meeting were met and (2) no business other than that stated as the purpose of the called meeting was conducted. C1.01, p. 18. **G.** 19-5.B, p. 50

- 2. The Committee will forward the following *notations requiring responses* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the Gulf South Presbytery.
  - a. When any Teaching Elder receives a new Call to a congregation within the Presbytery its Minutes must report that person's Terms of Call as approved in public using the forms found in the Book of Order and the Procedure Manual for Ministerial and Candidates Committees. No terms of call provided in minutes for TE Kyle, TE Stinson, TE Wagner, TE Mabray, TE Foster, TE Hutson or TE Woltmann. 17.17, the second #3, #11pp. 8, 9 19.05, the second #2, second #3, 16-19, pp. 34, 36. Acts of Assembly 12-11(1), p. 194
  - b. Were minutes of 18th Stated Meeting approved? Not mentioned in minutes of 19th Stated Meeting.
  - c. The approved budget should be included in the minutes, not just the notation that it was approved. 17.18, p. 10 *Rules for Assembly* IX 9-12
     G.16, p. 16
  - d. The Summary Financial Report from the previous year together with an independent review of that report must be embedded in the Minutes rather than as an attachment. 17th Meeting. 17.18 p. 10, *Rules for Assembly* IX 9-12G.16
  - e. It is not noted whether Candidate Williams has been member of his church for six months or more per G. 11-2A. 18.14, p. 28 G.11-2A, p. 27
  - f. Reports that the Ministerial Committee had approved the dissolution of the pastoral relationship between TE John Mabry and TE Jonathan Wagner with the Covenant Presbyterian Church of Monroe LA effective Sep 1, 2020, then on #2 and #3 below requests approval for the same two TE's to calls as Pastor and Associate Pastor to the same Covenant Presbyterian Church of Monroe LA. Finally, #4 of the same Minute appoints an Administrative Commission to install these TE's on Oct 25. Further explanation seems to be necessary to understand these actions. 19th Meeting. 19-05 #3 and #4 (p. 34).
- 3. The Committee will forward the following *notations* to Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the Gulf South Presbytery.
  - a. Advises that presbyteries "include a section on "Correspondence" in their minutes with dates on which official correspondence is received and sent." Not included for any of the reviewed minutes. Including this as not requiring a response as it is addressed in previous year's responses. *Acts of Assembly* 8-13.4 p. 192
  - b. Paragraph numbering in these sections include repeated numbers. Minutes should include sub-paragraph headings or avoid restarting numbering at 1 in future minutes. 17.17, pp. 7-9 19.05, pp. 34-36
- 4. General advice to the presbytery.
  - None
- 5. Commendations:

b. Commend the actions of the Presbytery Facilitators, and their willingness in normal times to travel long distances, and in Covid times find ways to keep visiting congregations 17.11, p. 5 18.11, p. 28

# G. Mid-America

1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of the Midwest Presbytery be approved with the *exceptions*.

- 2. The Committee will forward the following *notations requiring responses* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of Mid-America Presbytery.
  - No minutes from Brazeau, Providence, Riverside, Sutter, Trinity & Walnut Grove. Also, in some cases reviews were done for minutes in 2018. New churches Central West End and River City had no minutes. 86.02, 87.02, 88.02, 1260, 1275, 1285; G.19-4.A.7; *Rules for Assembly* 9-12G.10
  - 86th minutes (January): Included various financial reports in attachments as well as a 2020 budget but did not include an audit of 2019 records. *Rules for Assembly* 9-12G.16
  - c. Motion made and seconded to appoint the following commissions. No notation of approval recorded. 87.02, 1275; *Rules for Assembly* 9-12G.4; G.19-5D
  - d. RE's & TE's listed as absent, not unexcused. 86.01-D, 1255-1257 87.01-D, 1268-1270, 88.01-D, 1278-1280; *Rules for Assembly* 9-12G.1
  - e. Stated Clerk's report & Omnibus Motion: 'Other' TE's outside of the Presbytery were listed on page 1257 but there was no record of them being enrolled as corresponding members with privilege of floor. 86th minutes, pages 1259, 1260 *Acts of Assembly* 03-04.4
- 3. The Committee will forward the following *notations* to Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the Midwest Presbytery.
  - Attendance There was a list of "Guests". Were these "Observers", or unregistered guests not representing a church? There was no list of "Observers". 86th minutes, page 1257, 87th minutes, page 1270, 88th minutes, page 1280
  - b. Treasurer's report-The treasurer reported receipts 'Year to Date' of \$78,830. Since this report was given on January 24th, I'm guessing this 'Year to date' was for 2019. The report probably should have stated that this was for year 2019. The report also stated, "This year we paid pledges of \$25,000." I'm guessing this was also for 2019. 86th minutes, page 1261, section 86.03. Also, no report of an Independent Review/Audit for the previous year. *Rules for Assembly* IX 9-G.16
  - c. Terms of Call for Jeffery Parrett: The Terms of Call specifically excluded EPC group insurance. EPC Medical Insurance is a

requirement for EPC Ordained Pastors. There can be some exceptions and those exceptions should be listed in his call. 88th minutes, page 1286; *Acts of Assembly* 81-04

- 4. General advice to the presbytery. None
- 5. Commendations.
  - a. Attendance Absent but Excused Pastors were marked with (ex) after their name, Absent Unexcused Pastors were marked with (abs) after their name. The reason for excused absence was listed as part of the Stated Clerk's report. The Stated Clerk is to be commended for clearly marking Excused and Unexcused Pastors. 86th minutes, starting on page 1256, 87th minutes, starting on page 1268, 88th minutes, starting on page 1278
  - b. Declaration of Quorum: This was a Virtual meeting, and they went through a Roll Call to establish a quorum. That's a great way to verify who is on the call because just seeing the names you can see electronically often doesn't count multiple people sitting at the same computer, and attendees on the phone usually don't get their name displayed electronically. 87th minutes, page 1270
  - c. Omnibus Motion, Item 5 Sessional Records The Presbytery is to be commended for using the term "reviewed" in its statement listing churches that the Session Records Committee has reviewed (as opposed to simply 'received'). (*Acts of Assembly* 07-08 requires the names of churches whose Session minutes have been reviewed (not just received). 87th minutes, page 1275

#### H. Mid-Atlantic

1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of the Mid-Atlantic be approved with the following *exceptions*.

- 2. The Committee will forward the following *notations requiring responses* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the Mid-Atlantic Presbytery.
  - a. The Financial report for the year 2019 is not included in the body of the minutes of this meeting as required. 94th meeting, *Rules for Assembly* IX 9-12G.16
  - b. An independent review (or audit) of the 2019 Financial report is not included in the body of the minutes of this meeting as required. 94th meeting, *Rules for Assembly* IX 9-12G.16
  - c. The "Ratio Correction" analysis for the representation of RE's at each meeting of the Presbytery is not reported in the Minutes as required. 94th meeting. *Acts of Assembly* 05-08
  - d. Time of meeting start missing, #94/p.518/1; G.19-5A, *Rules for Assembly* 9-12G.1

- e. Time of meeting start missing, #17C/p.541/01; **G.**19-5A, *Rules for Assembly* 9-12G.1
- f. Absences were noted but not if Excused or Unexcused, #94/p.518-521/2; *Rules for Assembly* 9-12G.1
- g. Park Ave. Pres. Church James Lankford (TE or RE) not noted. #94/p.520 / 2; *Rules for Assembly* 9-12G.1
- h. Absences were noted but not if Excused or Unexcused. #96/p.541-544; *Rules for Assembly* 9-12G.1
- i. Terms of Call in Omnibus? Unclear if these are changed terms or new terms. #94/p.527/24.3.I & J; *Rules for Assembly* 9-12G.9
- 3. The Committee will forward the following *notations* to Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the Mid-Atlantic.
  - a. The minutes of the 96<sup>th</sup> Stated Meeting include the first six page numbers duplicated from those originally used for the Called Meeting of Aug. 24, 2020. 96th meeting.
  - b. Numbering of 94.24 and 94.25 duplicated, new numbering needed. 94.26 is also missing. #94/p.527-528/24-26
  - c. "Approved" used, but rest of document PASSED was used. #94/p.523/7
  - d. Punctuation error 95,11 to 95.11. #95/p.539/11
- 4. General advice to the presbytery.
  - None
- 5. Commendations :
  - a. Their careful and extensive preparation for the multiplication of this historic Presbytery into three that has been accomplished and an Overture to implement this decision is being submitted to the 2021 meeting of the General Assembly.

## I. Midwest

- 1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of the Midwest Presbytery be approved with the following *exceptions*.
  - a. Candidates were asked questions, but no record was provided of examinations and no details of the candidates such as church membership and session endorsement. Does not state that the motion passed. 170-08, p.204-205; *Rules for Assembly* 9-12G.7, *Rules for Assembly* 9-12G.4; G.19-5D; G.11-2
  - b. No record of examinations and no details of the candidates such as church membership and session endorsement. Does not state that the motion passed. 171-17, p.233; Rules for Assembly 9-12G.7, *Rules for Assembly* 9-12G.4; G.19-5D; G.11-2
  - c. There was an attachment showing that Session minutes were received (53 of 57 churches), that included the church name, but none had been indicated as reviewed. There was no column indicating "Reviewed". This review information needs to be in the body of the minutes. 169th meeting, 169 Attachment B; 171-11, p.231; G 19-4.A.7; *Rules for Assembly* 9-12G.10; *Acts of Assembly* 07-08.1
  - d. Candidates Care Committee report: There were no details of how Matthew Grimm was examined for ordination. **G**.12-2

- e. There were no details of how David Menzel was examined to come under care of the Presbytery. TE Chris Winans was approved as David Menzel's advisor, but it was not recorded that TE Winans is not Mr. Menzel's Pastor169th minutes, page 186, section 169-16; **G**.11-2
- f. Candidates Committee. There were no G.11-2 details for candidate-comingunder-care Blaise Shields. The two advisors for Blaise Shields were not identified as not being Mr. Shields Pastor. There were no G.11-2 details for candidatecoming-under-care Brandon LaFontaine. The two advisors for Mr. LaFontaine were not identified as not being Mr. LaFontaine's Pastor. There were no G.11-2 details for candidate-coming-under-care Octavio Samaniego. The two advisors for Mr. Samaniego were not identified as not being Mr. Samaniego's Pastor. There were no G.11-2 details for candidate-coming-under-care S.K. (full name redacted for security) The advisor for Mr. K. was not identified as not being his Pastor. 170th minutes, page 204, 205 section 170-08, G.11-2
- g. Ministerial Committee: Omnibus motion #1: "Move TE Paul Copeland to retired rolls." There were no details from G.15 (Retiring Pastors) in the minutes. Acts of Assembly 12-11. #2: "ON MOTION: That Peace Church ... be dismissed to independence". This motion should have included details that all sections of G.5-10 (Dismissal) were followed. 171st meeting, Page 230, continuation of section 171-09
- h. Candidates Care Committee: 2 Candidates were introduced, but no details of their exam (G.11-2C) were recorded. Advisors for the 2 candidates were not noted as not being the candidate's Pastor. 171st minutes, page 233, section 171-17 G.11-2
- 2. The Committee will forward the following *notations requiring responses* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the Midwest Presbytery.
  - a. Attendance: A status column, as shown in 169-3 would be helpful, as it is not possible to discern the status of those listed. Some names show Out of Bounds, etc. but not all do. 170-3, 171-03 pg.202-203, 225-227; *Rules for Assembly* 9-12G.1
  - b. 169th minutes, page 184, section 169-5 Ministerial Committee Part One: Omnibus Motion: Approve the change in Terms of Call for TE Art Hunt (70 yrs old). The change in Term of Call was not detailed. Was this a change in Term of Call, or a Renewal of Pastoral Relationship at age 70? Approve the change in Terms of Call for TE Doug Thompson (70 yrs old). The change in ToC was not detailed. Was this a change in Term of Call, or a Renewal of Pastoral Relationship at age 70? Acts of Assembly 12-11.2
  - c. Council Report. The motion and vote on descending overtures did not include a brief summary description of the overture. 169th minutes, page 185, section 169-10; *Acts of Assembly* 07-08.3
  - d. Exam of TE Aaron Klein. Attachment 2 contained a list of the Administrative Commission to install TE Klein. The title of the list included the title of "Senior Pastor". The Job description (attachment 1) also had the title of "Senior Pastor". Note that there is no title of Senior Pastor in EPC, there is only Pastor, Associate Pastor, Assistant Pastor, Transitional Pastor, Stated Supply Pastor, and Occasional Supply Pastor.

Called Meeting of July 29. G.9-5A1

- e. There was no section for Correspondence received and sent. 169th minutes, 170th minutes, 171st minutes. *Acts of Assembly* 08-13.4
- f. Two of three motions not shown as approved. 171-13, p.232; *Rules for Assembly* 9-12G.4; **G**.19-5D
- g. Motion made but doesn't state approved change of call for TE Soon Pak. 170-06, p.204; *Rules for Assembly* 9-12G.4; G.19-5D
- 3. The Committee will forward the following *notations* to Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the Midwest Presbytery.
  - Attendance It appears that you are using "P" for Present, "E" for Excused absence, & "U" for Unexcused absence for Pastors. A legend explaining that would be helpful to make that clear. 169th minutes; 170th minutes; Called meeting July 29; 171<sup>st</sup> minutes.
  - b. Ministerial Committee Part One: Omnibus Motion: Approve the retirement of TE Wally Hostetter. No details of G.15-1B (Recognition of retirement) were recorded. 169th minutes, page 184, section 169-5
  - c. 169th minutes, page 187 & 188, section 169-17 Ministerial Committee. The approval of the call of TE Andrew Winter included Terms of Call. Within those Terms of Call, it was recorded that TE Winter's Housing Allowance was included in his Salary. Housing Allowance was not separated as required by IRS. Same for TE SJ Winter – Housing Allowance included in his Salary. Same for TE Joyce Harris – Housing Allowance included in her Salary. Same for TE Jerry Van Auken on page 189 – Housing Allowance included in his Salary. Same for TE Andrew Morton – Housing Allowance included in his Salary. There were 8 Pastors whose call was approved, only 3 separated Housing from Salary. Separating Housing Allowance from Salary is an important IRS requirement. IRS requires that Housing Allowance be specified by the church – and is not retroactive, so must be specified in advance. 169th minutes, page 187 & 188, section 169-17
- 3. General advice to the presbytery.
  - None
- 4. Commendations.
  - Attendance lists 169th minutes, 171<sup>st</sup> minutes TE's were listed with P, E, & U beside their name, signifying Present, Excused, and Unexcused. The Clerk is to be commended for including E & U. Excellent attendance report. Makes all categories of attendees understandable.
  - b. Receiving and approving 53 sets of minutes is commendable! 93% of churches is awesome!

#### J. Pacific Northwest

1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of the Pacific Northwest Presbytery be approved with the following *exceptions*.

- a. Authorization for a Commissioned Pastor shall be for a term of up to 3 years and may be renewed. No term specified for RE Jim Day.7-35, p.170; G.9-11.A, p.19
- b. Administrative Commissions of Presbytery shall have a ratio close to 2RE to 1TE, have not fewer than 5 members, and shall have REs representing not fewer than two member churches. (1) None of these requirements are met for the Administrative Commission approved to install RE Spencer. (2) Administrative Commission appointed to install RE Jim Day has only 3 members and no TEs. (1) 8-13, 8th page, (2) 9-20, 12th page, G.21-1C2 and 21-1C2B
- 2. The Committee will forward the following *notations requiring responses* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the Pacific Northwest Presbytery.
  - a. When any Teaching Elder receives a new Call to a congregation within the Presbytery its Minutes must report that person's Terms of Call as approved in public using the forms found in the Book of Order and the Procedure Manual for Ministerial and Candidates Committees. (1) No terms of call provided in minutes for TE Weems, TE Spencer, TE White, TE Hawkins and TE Heming. (2) In response to similar comments from the PRC last year, it was stated that "The Clerk will follow this requirement in the future." However, at the 9th Stated Meeting, the Presbytery approved a process which does not appear to meet the requirement of approval being made "in public" but delegates approval to the Ministerial Committee. (1) 7-36, p. 170, 8-13, 8th page, 8-18, 15th page, 9-11, 7th page, 9-16d, 10th page, (2) 9-18, 11th page, *Acts of Assembly* 12-11(1), p. 194
  - b. Calling an Assistant Pastor as an Associate Pastor at the same church requires a <sup>3</sup>/<sub>4</sub> vote of Session. There is no indication that the call of TE Samuel Weems was approved by <sup>3</sup>/<sub>4</sub> of the church's Session. 7-36, p.170; G.10-6B, p.23
  - c. G.10-4G requires congregation to "appoint representative to advocate the call (of Pastor) at a meeting of the Presbytery." Did anyone advocate for TE Heming? 9-16d, p.10; G.10-4G, p.22-23
- 3. The Committee will forward the following *notations* to Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the Pacific Northwest Presbytery.
  - a. There are no page numbers in minutes of the 8th or 9th Stated Meetings. 8th & 9th, all pages; *Acts of Assembly* 05-08.4, p. 190 *Acts of Assembly* 16-25.2, p. 196
  - b. The 4th paragraph should be divided into two paragraphs to separate the two topics of the church name change and the prayer for Rev Johnson's family. 7-5, p. 161
- 4. General advice to the presbytery.

- 5. Commendations.
  - a. Minutes are clearly written. Attention to detail, especially concerning Book of Order guidelines, is specific and clear.

 b. I like the way ministerial actions for each stated meeting are summarized in the New to Rolls and Change of Status sections of the attendance roster. 7-2, p. 160 8-3, 5th page, 9-3, 5th page

#### K. Pacific Southwest

- 1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of the Pacific Southwest Presbytery be approved with the following *exceptions*.
  - a. Use of the title "Executive Pastor" for a TE. EPC TEs may be titles Pastor, Associate Pastor, Assistant Pastor, Transitional Pastor, Stated Supply or Occasional Pastor "These are the only recognized callings for Teaching Elders in a congregational setting.", #9/p.117/9-8, **G.**9-5-A.1
- 2. The Committee will forward the following *notations requiring responses* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the Pacific Southwest Presbytery.
  - a. No Notation of RE's. Names are given but not clearly noted as RE's (the right column names- heading not present). #9/p.111/9-2, *Rules for Assembly* 9.12-G.1
  - b. At 8th meeting, the dissolution of pastoral relationships does not state that both the TE and the congregation concur. It was properly noted in the 7th Stated Meeting of the POPSW see 7-16 & 7-17. 8th, 8-14, pg.109.
  - c. It isn't explicitly stated that the presbytery approved the one exception to the Westminster Confession. "The examination of all Teaching Elders for ordination shall include an approval of their position with respect to the Westminster Standards either with no stated exceptions or an acceptance of any stated exception(s). The exception(s) are not recorded in the Minutes. G.12-4.", 9th, 9-7, pg.116
  - d. At 9th meeting, the dissolution of pastoral relationships does not state that both the TE and the congregation concur. It was properly noted in the 7th Stated Meeting of the POPSW see 7-16 & 7-17. 9th, 9-27-4,5,6,7, pg.123
  - e. No Terms of Call Reported or Recorded Approved, #8/p.016/8-7, #8/p.018/8-13, #9/p.116/9-7, #9/p.117/9-8, #9/p.118/9-11, #9/p.121/9-21 *Acts of Assembly* 12-11 (G.19-4B.3)
- 3. The Committee will forward the following *notations* to Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the Pacific Southwest Presbytery.
  - a. In the 7th Stated Meeting 7-1 "Outgoing Moderator, TE, Rev. Rob Perkins, called the sixth meeting of the Pacific Southwest (POPS) to order at 9:05 am and opened the meeting with prayer". So the time is correct, BUT, the number of the meeting is incorrect.
- 4. General advice to the presbytery.

- 5. Commendations.
  - a. Their inclusion of their Parity Report in the Minutes., 7-9, pg.93
  - b. The pastoral care demonstrated in the recognition of those TE's retiring from active ministry. 7-43 & 44, pg. 99-100, 9-25 & 9-26, pg. 122-123

### L. Rivers and Lakes

1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of Rivers and Lakes Presbytery be approved with the following *exceptions*.

None

- 2. The Committee will forward the following *notations requiring responses* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of Rivers and Lakes Presbytery.
  - a. 28th Stated Meeting. An independent review of the Financial report for 2019 is required to be included in the body of the Minutes. *Rules for Assembly* IX 9-12G.16
  - b. 30th Stated Meeting. The Adopted Budget for 2021 was not included in the body of the Minutes as required. *Acts of Assembly* 05-08
  - c. Action is unclear What was done with these recommendations? Were they voted on? Or were there commission powers given to the MC? #28/p.502/07, 21-2.2e
  - d. Benediction, not prayer noted to close the Presbytery. #29/p.509/09 *Rules for Assembly* 9-12G.2
- The Committee will forward the following *notations* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of Rivers and Lakes. None
- 4. General advice to the presbytery.
  - None
- 5. Commendations:
  - a. Deciding to offer RE training at each Presbytery meeting covering three important tracks: The Means of Grace, Polity, and the Ministry of the Local Church.
  - b. Very well organized, easy to read and good detail on discussions. Well done separating motions and making actions clear.

## M. Southeast

1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of the Southeast Presbytery be approved with the following *exceptions*.

- 2. The Committee will forward the following *notations requiring responses* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the Southeast Presbytery.
  - a. Although a summary of the annual Financial report for 2019 is included in the Minutes, the required independent review of the full 2019 report is not include in these Minutes. 109th Meeting. 109.19 (p. 17), *Rules for Assembly* IX 9-12; **G.**16
  - b. Presbyteries must follow the provision of **G.** 11-2E, namely that the advisor of a candidate coming under care should not ordinarily be the candidate's pastor. No Advisor reported. 109-09, p.10; 111-07, p.50; *Acts of Assembly* 06-08.
  - c. TE/RE Disparity When a disproportionate ratio of Teaching Elders to Ruling Elders occurs in a Presbytery, a "Ratio Correction" is a constitutional requirement and must be spread in the Minutes annually. All 3 sets of minutes. *Acts of Assembly* 05-08. G. 19-2A.4b

- The Committee will forward the following *notations* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the Southeast Presbytery. None
- 4. General advice to the presbytery.
  - a. With regard to the Stated Clerk's response to the PRC's list of "Notations Requiring a Response" for the Presbytery's Minutes for 2019, the following is offered for clarification. The annual review of all Presbytery Minutes by the General Assembly's PRC is required primarily to provide both a historical and legal record of compliance with the requirements of the Constitution of the EPC and its various General Assemblies. The Stated Clerk should strive to record the Presbytery's actions in such a way as to reflect that need for a stand-alone historical and legal record.
- 5. Commendations.
  - a. The Presbytery, through its Church Health/Growth Committee is initiating a quarterly publication called "Did You Know". This will include information regarding actions and important events from both the Presbytery and the General Assembly. It can also include similar information from its member churches, and even from individual TE's and RE's. It will be distributed after each Presbytery and General Assembly meeting.

#### N. West

- 1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of Presbytery of the West be approved with the following *exceptions*.
  - a. Rev. Warmath's examination was approved and his acceptance into the Presbytery of the West was approved, but no mention is made of approval of his Out of Bounds Call or of approval of a term of up to three years. 121st Stated, pp. 9-10, 121:12B; G10-8B.2.a
- 2. The Committee will forward the following *notations requiring responses* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the Presbytery of the West.
  - a. Minutes should record that the meeting opened with prayer. Note that at the 120th meeting the "convening invocation" was eventually given after declaration of quorum, passage of the docket and explanation of meeting rules. Opening prayer not noted for 119<sup>th</sup>, 120<sup>th</sup>, and 121<sup>st</sup> meeting. 119th Stated, p. 12-289, 119:1, 120th Stated, p. 12-313, 120:1; p. 12-315, 120:5; 121<sup>st</sup>, 121:1,p.1; *Rules for Assembly* 9-12. G. 2, p.166; G.16-1A
  - b. Minutes should include a brief summary of the descending overture. Paragraph on approval of Descending Overtures 19-A and 19-B does not even mention the subject matter of either motion. 119th Stated, p. 12-296, 119:9A. Acts of Assembly 07-8.3, p. 191.
  - c. When any Teaching Elder receives a new Call to a congregation within the Presbytery its Minutes must report that person's Terms of Call as approved in public using the forms found in the **Book of Order** and the Procedure Manual for Ministerial and Candidates Committees. No terms of call provided in minutes for TE King Candidate Butkus, Rev. Warmath or Candidate Bremerman. 119th

Stated, p. 12-300, 119:12B. 121st Stated, p. 8, 121:10; p. 11, 121.12A; p. 13, 121:14; *Acts of Assembly* 12-11(1), p. 194

- d. Minutes shall list the names of each Teaching Elder member of the Presbytery and note that person's attendance as present, excused, or unexcused. Only those TEs present for the 120th Stated Meeting are listed in the minutes. 120th, pp. 12-313, 12-314, 120:2 *Acts of Assembly* 00-11, p. 189
- e. Ministers who requested to be excused part of omnibus but names not listed#120/p.3 (12-315)/120:6.B; #121/p.8 /121:8.C; *Rules for Assembly* 12-G1
- f. "judicial matters" were discussed in executive session, but nothing was reported out. An Executive session may be used for the discussion of sensitive and/or confidential topics but any motions resulting from such discussion by the presbytery must be done in an open session so that the action may be recorded in the Minutes of the meeting. Minutes must report any judicial cases before Presbytery and the disposition thereof in accordance with the steps required in the Book of Discipline. Statement in minutes that there was a need to "address" judicial matters implies action – if not the case minutes should note that it was only a report and that no action was taken. 121st Stated, p.15, 121:17; G19-4B7.
- 3. The Committee will forward the following *notations* to Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of Presbytery of the West.
  - a. Commissioned Pastor and Pastor are two distinct positions, and the terms should not be used interchangeably. A Commissioned Pastor is authorized specific powers normally held by the Pastor, but he does not serve as the Pastor of a local church. The phrases "allow RE Denlinger to serve as their Pastor" and "allow a Commissioned Pastor to serve as the pastor of a local church" are incorrect. It appears that the actions taken were correct, but the language used in the minutes should be modified. 119th Stated, p. 12-299, 119:12A. **G**9-11
  - b. Presbytery Minutes pages shall be consecutively numbered in the permanent record. Page numbers for the permanent record are missing from minutes of 121st meeting. 121st Stated, all pages *Acts of Assembly* 16-25(2), p. 196
  - c. Ministers and Elders are used at the heading of the attendance, perhaps Teaching Elders and Ruling Elders would be clearer as they are tallied later as such. (p.(6)12-294); 119/p.1(12-289)/119:2; 21/p.1/121:1; Acts of Assembly 00-11 & 03-04.4
- 4. General Advice to the Presbytery. None
- 5. Commendations.